

NCHRP 15-33 FY 2006
AASHTO GUIDE FOR TRANSPORTATION LANDSCAPE AND ENVIRONMENTAL DESIGN
REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

COMMENT NUMBER	COMMENT LOCATION	COMMENT	ACTION
1	General Overview	<p>I applaud the direction that the guide is taking. Expanding users thinking and broadening their awareness and knowledge via a corridor perspective for transportation solutions is very important. However, by taking a broader corridor perspective, and subsequently the broader ‘scale’ that such a perspective incorporates, requires many important areas necessary to appropriately address this scale. Many of these areas have been left out and must be included for this guide to most useful and successful, one that contributes greatly to better transportation planning and design practice. The areas necessary for inclusion are: 1) An overarching regional design discussion to set a solid framework and context for corridors; 2) Urban design fundamentals need be discussed before specific corridor types are defined; 3) Community Planning and Design; 4) Aesthetics - planting aesthetics are discussed without any connection to or reference to a broader discussion on aesthetics; 5) Nodes – corridors can’t be complete without a sound understanding of how they inter-connect various types of nodes such as green spaces squares, parks (such as Central Park or those found in Boston); and lastly 6) Transects – an extremely important design approach that provides sound fundamental structure within this entire area of design. A wealth of information on these components of planning and design are available from Georgia Institute of Technology Center for Quality Growth and Regional Development at www.cqgrd.gatech.edu/TDC_Presentations.php Specifically review module 2 beginning at slide 45. <i>This is extremely important information.</i> The principles and examples contained within this body of knowledge should be incorporated into the guide.</p>	<p>Add critical sections pertaining to 1) Regional Design; 2) Urban Design fundamentals; 3) Community Planning and Design; 4) Aesthetics; 5) Nodes; 6) Transect Design Applications</p>
2	General Overview	<p>Change the title regarding LA ‘Sensibilities’ either to ‘Applications’ or drop the word entirely and let LA stand on its own. <i>LA’s have for too long been regarded as ‘touchy/feely’ in their approach rather than as sound, ethical planning and design professionals that use creative, innovative, common sense while promoting and practicing good, effective, highly valued, sustainable design principles.</i> Do not continue to repeat this stereotype of the past. Keeping ‘Sensibilities’ in the title further endorses the ‘touchy/feeling’ mischaracterization of a great profession. Drop it. Besides the word is getting overused.</p>	<p>Revise the guide title.</p>

Date: 6/13/08

NCHRP 15-33 FY 2006
AASHTO GUIDE FOR TRANSPORTATION LANDSCAPE AND ENVIRONMENTAL DESIGN
REVIEW COMMENT SHEET

3	General Overview	Other important references and sources for transportation design that should be cited. They include: 1) NCHRP Report 480: A Guide to Best Practices in Achieving Context Sensitive Solutions, TRB; 2) 'Context Sensitive Solutions in Designing Major Urban Thoroughfares for Walkable Communities', ITE;	Reference additional works cited...
4	General Overview	Chapter 4 –why are highway geometric elements such as vertical alignments, horizontal alignments, coordinating alignments and profiles, and cross-sections discussed? These are nearly identical to what is discussed in 'A Guide to Achieving Flexibility in Highway Design', Chapter 3. It is not necessary to restate this same material that can be found in other guides. Reference it. Instead use this chapter to address the important components identified in comment 1.	Delete highway geometrics that can be found in several other guides and manuals. Rather devote the chapter to the specific aspects embodied in CSS that will influence geometric design considerations.
5	General Overview	Project level scale discussions with examples that integrate corridor level concepts are needed to ensure more success will be achieved and carried out in actual built form. Otherwise they will remain conceptual in nature and the chances of them being incorporated into actual projects remote. Guidance needs to be supported with specific examples which illustrate specific design features in order to be effective.	Guidance needs to be supported with specific examples which illustrate specific design features in order to be effective.
6	Specific Comment	Contextual Analysis needs an in-depth discussion and considerable examples of how why and where it applies both: the overall project development process and specific project examples. It provides little value to discuss CA without meaningful examples for professionals to fully grasp and understand these principles and concepts. Our experience finds that saying that CA should be done is one thing but without providing good examples and guidance on <i>how to perform it</i> will results in falling short of achieving the desired results.	Provide examples of CA and specific information on how to perform it - including process recommendations.
7	Specific Comment	Noise walls and sound barriers are illustrated on page 43 however the discussion pertains to retaining walls. Sound barrier examples shown here are misleading. and should not be included within this section. Rather include a separate section devoted to sound barrier and environmental screening, an important function needed within corridor solutions.	Include a separate section devoted to sound barrier and environmental screening, important functions needed within corridor solutions.

Date: 6/13/08

**NCHRP 15-33 FY 2006
AASHTO GUIDE FOR TRANSPORTATION LANDSCAPE AND ENVIRONMENTAL DESIGN
REVIEW COMMENT SHEET**

8	Specific Comment	Many run-on sentences exist throughout the document that are too numerous to mention.	Edit run-on sentences.
9	Specific Comment	Chapt 1, page 1, 4 th para, 1 st sentence: What does this sentence mean? Too much jargon and DOT speak. Put into plain English.	Rewrite sentence /paragraph
10	Specific Comment	Here again, I applaud the inclusion of performance measurement (and management) within the guide. By addressing the issue of performance relative to the success of corridors it demonstrates the importance of systematically practicing and determining whether or not an agency is achieving its intended results. The following specific comments apply.	
11	Specific Comment	Chapt 3; second para; Cite NCHRP guide for Performance Measures for CSS; There is considerable information available in this area and it seems somewhat self severing of the authors to think that HNTB were the sole developers of performance criteria for CSS. Ok to discuss their example but cover the other works too. In actuality, Utah DOT had prepared a substantial body of work and guidance in this area prior to 2005. Recommend referencing Utah DOT; Washington State DOT and others in this area too. Research this if necessary to be accurate and credible.	Expand on the background here; provide other examples available to be more accurate; cite other works;
12	Specific Comment	Chapt 3; To be most successful, performance measures and management processes should be well integrated within a department-wide approach based on an agency's business practices. Simply identifying a few performance measures will not provide a great deal of meaningful guidance. The process of incorporating performance measures into decision making practices along with how they fit the agencies strategic direction is critical. More discussion is warranted to address 1 st the broader field of performance management within organizations and then how the principles contained within this guide should integrate with existing or planned organizational practice.	Include a broader performance management context and then describe how examples of performance measures fit that context.
13	Specific Comment	Chapt 3, page 17, 3rd para, 3rd sentence: What is 'a landscape architecture and environmental design sensibility' and how would this work? The statement needs more explanation, justification and or description of what is meant. As stated, it does not add much clarity or value nor is it easily understood. How would additional knowledge be applied?	Rewrite paragraph and be more specific on how it would add additional knowledge and value.
14	Specific Comment	Chapt 3, page 17, 4 th para, 2 nd sentence: The statement on data is over-simplistic. Be more specific such as, recommending how data, including corridor data, be part of an integrated systems approach tied to a larger corporate process to be most effective.	Expand

Date: 6/13/08

**NCHRP 15-33 FY 2006
AASHTO GUIDE FOR TRANSPORTATION LANDSCAPE AND ENVIRONMENTAL DESIGN
REVIEW COMMENT SHEET**

15	Specific Comment	Chapt 3, page 25, Conclusion: This paragraph by itself understates or leaves out entirely many factors and processes that will need to be in place in order to measure success, and build success. How are decisions made internally that drive success? More discussion with specific implementation examples, case studies, and best practices are warranted in order to provide readers with enough understanding of how and why it will provide value and meaning.	Expand with ample examples. Performance management is not well developed in the transportation field. Thus it is important to provide enough information and supporting documentation for readers to care.
16	Specific Comment	Since this document was first written in 1991 and not updated since the initial publication, it should be as far reaching as absolutely possible. Include emerging critical areas such as energy and environmental sustainability; other transportation modes such as light rail and PRTs; and corridor connectivity to other modes. Someone must take the lead and it should be LAs.	Expand into emerging vital transportation areas – take a leadership role in addressing them.
17	Specific Comment	Land use issues are a significant and growing factor influencing design and the design of corridors. Accordingly, land use issues should be greatly expanded.	Expand land use as a factor for corridor design